Food safety along informal pork market chains in Vietnam – successes and challenges from an integrative research team view

Fred Unger\(^1\)*, Hung Nguyen-Viet\(^1\), Lucy Lapar\(^1\), Phuc Pham Duc\(^2\) Pham Van Hung\(^3\), Pham Hong Ngan\(^3\), Max Barot\(^1\), Delia Grace\(^1\)

\(^1\) International Livestock Research Institute, Nairobi, Kenya and Hanoi, Vietnam
\(^3\) Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Vietnam National University of Agriculture, Hanoi, Vietnam
\(^2\) Center for Public Health and Ecosystem Research, Hanoi School of Public Health, Vietnam

4th International One Health Congress & 6th Biennial Congress of the International Association for Ecology and Health (One Health EcoHealth 2016)
Melbourne, Australia, 3–7 December 2016
Outline

Food safety and role of pork in Vietnam
PigRISK – approach, key results and challenges
Integrated research team
Conclusion & way forward
Why food safety

WHO’s report: First global estimates of foodborne diseases
- almost 1 in 10 people fall ill every year from eating contaminated food and 420,000 die as a result
- With 33 million DALYs FBD are of a similar burden in order of magnitude as the “big three” infectious diseases HIV/AIDS, malaria and tuberculosis
- Children under 5 years of age are at particularly high risk
- African and South-East Asia Regions have the highest burden

http://www.who.int/foodsafety/publications/foodborne_disease/fergreport/en/
Food safety – Vietnam

- **Food safety** among the **most pressing issues for people** in Vietnam, more important than education or health care
- Repeated episodes of adulterated and unsafe food
  - Pesticides in vegetables, **mass fish intoxication**, antibiotics residues
  - While biological hazards are the most important **risk perception towards chemical** hazards
- Reported outbreaks 370 (2014-2015), 66 fatalities, very high underreporting expected (>1/100)
- Vietnam has a **modern food safety legislation system**
  - Food exports relatively well managed but deficits in domestic markets
- Use of **risk based approach** and risk communication **limited**
Pork is an **important component** of the Vietnamese diet

- More than 70% of consumed meat is pork
- Annual pork consumption per capita in Vietnam: 27kg
- 83% comes from very small or small farms
- 76% of pigs are processed in small slaughtering, nearly 30,000
- Preference for fresh “warm” pork supplied in retail traditional markets (80% of all pork marketed)
  - affordable, address local demands
  - often escape effective control

- Consumption of risky pork products is common
  (raw fermented/blood pudding)
Food safety risk assessment along the pork value chain

PigRISK project (2012-2017)

To assess impacts of pork-borne diseases on human health and the livestock and identify control points for risk management.

Integrated approach
- Interdisciplinary team
  Vets, PH, Economist, Animal Science, Modeller

Study sites
2 provinces
  Hung Yen, peri-urban
  Nghe An, rural
Pig Risk - VC approach
Placed at specific actor along VC based on RA results

From farm to fork

Systems context – actions taken by one affect all.
“Weak links” in the chain may accentuate disease risk – **challenge & opportunity**
1 Risk profiling & hazard identification Literature review, PRA, Base line

2-3 Risk assessment

Microbial Risk Assessment
Chemical Risk Assessment
Animal Health Risk Assessment
Economics (eg cost of illness)
Rapid assessment
Economic assessment
VIETGAHP

4 Synthesis

Interventions (2017 +)
Intervention 1
Intervention 2
Intervention 3

5 System dynamics model

6 Engaging stakeholders, advocacy, communication

<modified after Sinh et. al. 2016>

Framework

Value chain

Risk assessment

Biological hazards:
Salmonella spp.
Streptococcus suis (Coliform and E. coli)

Chemical hazards:
AB residues
Growth promoters
Heavy metals
PigRISK Selected results

- **Biological hazards** (Salmonella) are present in the pork value chain and increase along the chain: 44% in cut pork at retail market
  - Highest amplification at slaughterhouse but exposure starts at farm (20% Salmonella in drinking water for pigs)
  - Low priority given to food safety by producers (highest: feed and pig prices)

- **Risk** for consumer **determined**
  - First quantitative risk assessment for Salmonella in pork for Vietnam
  - Around one out of 10 consumers are infected by pork-related salmonellosis annually

- **First cost of illness** estimate for pork borne diseases
  - Hospitalisation alone was around $6 million per year

- **Assessment of chemical hazards** in pork
  - **contrary to public opinion**, chemicals studied **responsible for little health risk**, but banned substances were present in a few samples.
Intervention development - PIG SLAUGHTER-HOUSE

Pilot trial: Significant reduction of cofiforms

Source: Unger, 2015
PIG SLAUGHTER-HOUSE – challenges observed
Behavior/practice change

Challenge: Missing incentive for safer pork at retailer

Source: Unger, 2016
Multi-disciplinary research team established and functioning

What makes it work?

• Involvement of research teams already as early as in the concept note phase
• Strong recognised expertise, clear tasks, contributions, outputs identified and maintained
  – VNUA Econ team: Value chain, economic assessment and system dynamics model
  – VNUA Vet team: Animal health risks
  – HUPH: Public health and biological risk assessment
Incentives/gains for the teams

- Capacity building, > 10 training courses tailored to team needs
  - VC analysis, system dynamics, risk assessment, >60 students
- Gained recognition which led to new assignments
  - VNUA team was contacted by other institutions to conduct “value chain” courses
  - HUPH team involved in establishment of National Taskforce on Food Safety and WorldBank Food Safety Assessment (2016)
- Track record on publications & scientific recognition
  - Joint papers but also room for individual papers
  - >10 peer reviewed international & > 20 national
- New proposals developed with high chance of acceptance
Challenges:

- Turnover of members was high (mainly due to pursuit of higher studies), leading to delays in some activities
  - also a positive outcome, because project members obtained new opportunities
- Cross cutting analyses of results, time consuming, resulted in considerable delay of analyses but also publications
Conclusions

- Various challenges related food safety
  - Biological hazards (Salmonella) in pork pose a considerable risk for the consumer
  - Situation for chemical hazards less dramatic while public perception focuses on those
- Strong links to policy makers established
- Inter-disciplinary team successfully established and sustainable
  - Success based on clear tasks, outputs and incentives
- PigRISK focused on assessment with many “first” but less progress was made on risk management
  - Will receive specific attention in a currently developed new project
  - Several pork value chains (e.g. native pigs, caterers providing pork to industrial zones, private boutique outlets selling “organic” pork …)
  - Incentive based light touched interventions
Acknowledgment

- Vietnam National University of Agriculture
- Hanoi University of Public Health
- Local authorities in Hung Yen and Nghe An
- Involved various VC actors and groups

Publications in 2016
- Int Jnl PH
  - QMRA
  - Risk communication (chemical versus biological)
- Int Jnl for Food Prot
  - Perception on food borne disease